Journal of Accounting Information and Innovation
Vol.6, No.8, August-2020;
ISSN (4243 – 406X);
p –ISSN 3467 – 7038
Impact factor: 5.83

CREATIVE ACCOUNTING AND PERFORMANCE OF DEPOSIT MONEY BANKS IN NIGERIA

John Odo, Ph.D. and James Ike Ugwu, Ph.D.
Department of Accounting and Finance, Godfrey Okoye University, Enugu, Nigeria

Abstract: *The sudden collapse of firms in recent past have cast doubt on the quality of accounting services of the employees and credibility and quality of work of auditor (internal and external) as accountants are being accused of succumbing to the pressure from the management to prepare and present report suggestive of impressive performance and clean bill of health of the organization concerned. The study therefore evaluated the contribution of creative accounting practices on the performance of deposit money banks in Nigeria. The study adopted survey research design. Judgmental random sampling technique was employed to select four banks out of 21 deposit money banks in Nigeria. Primary data were collected from 60 respondents that were chosen through stratified random sampling technique. Descriptive statistics were used to analyze hypotheses one and two in which responses to the questionnaire in 5 points Likert Scale were clustered into two groups. Correlation technique was adopted in analysis of hypothesis three. The results of the analyses showed that creative accounting contributes significantly to non-financial and financial performance of banks in Nigeria. Also revealed was high correlation between contribution of creative accounting practices on financial and non financial performance of banks.* The research concludes that creative accounting negatively affect banks in Nigeria as decisions made based on the information so provided were deceptive hence the reports of corporate collapse as a result of such actions. *The study recommends amongst others that Accountants in the employ of organizations with intent to indulge in creative accounting practice should resist and/or persuade the management by explaining in details the implications of engaging in the act as it is unethical and give misleading financial performance indication.*

Keywords: Creative accounting, Performance, Deposit money banks

1.1 Introduction

Accounting profession has been under severe criticism due to sudden collapse and failure of some firms which have had their financial statements prepared by accountants and audited by renowned auditors. Developed and developing nations have had similar experiences. Whenever there is a corporate failure the question always is: Where are the auditors? Many are tempted to believe that corporate failures are synonymous with audit failures as their failure have put question mark on the integrity and competence of the auditors in particular and by extension the entire profession. Accountants in the employee of organizations have been caught in a cross road as they have to serve their masters (Management) and uphold profession ethics as well as exhibit competence. The exerting influences of the management on the accountants as well as the auditors are enormous. This dangerous relationship seems to have not only affected audit quality but have resulted in flash light widespread of creative accounting syndrome; all in a bid to satisfy the management. The intricate involvement of accountants and management has made it difficult to isolate creative accounting issues from poor corporate governance. It has been established that many companies manipulate accounting figures and embark on deliberate breaches of the accounting system and controls in order to facilitate the financial goals reporting established by management (Eze 2016). Furthermore, Olatunde and Olayinka (2014), assert that creative accounting practices are the root cause of a number of accounting scandals and corporate collapse.

The threat posed by creative accounting to the survival of firms has not only become a critical source of worry to corporate firms in Nigeria but also a sign of a failing firm. Being a dangerous sign to the world economy, the issue has continued to receive considerable attention in recent years from academics, market participants, and regulators due to recent corporate failures that has brought about doubts in the minds of stakeholders on the credibility and reliability of financial reports.

It is widely accepted that it is the duty of the management of any firm to present an objective financial report that can be attested to be of free and fair view by the auditors upon which wide range of users can rely on while making economic decisions. Where the report is not objectively prepared or is manipulated to achieve selfish aim or the validity of this objective is being questioned by many users of corporate financial reports, it becomes suicidal to rely on such report. Apart from stakeholders relying on the reports in making investment decisions, it is equally an issue to the management of the firms as every decision made based on the manipulated financial report is bound to fail.

The idea of manipulating the financial report known as creative accounting is deceptive, dangerous and ethically wrong. Creative accounting is a growing issue of concern, threatening the credibility of both the accounting and auditing functions. While the problem of creative accounting is not new, it was one of the key themes in corporate finance and corporate governance in the 1980s (Merchant and Rocknes 1994). By the early 1990s, creative accounting was well and truly recognized by national and international regulators as one of their major challenges of financial reporting and it has developed geographically both in its practices' complexity and in its nomenclature. Thus, the term used most frequently as well as in United States of America (USA) is "Creative Accounting," whereas, in Europe the phrase "Earnings Management" is often used. In other literatures, creative accounting is referred to as Income Smoothing, Earnings Smoothing, Cosmetic Accounting or Accounting Cosmetics, Financial Crafts or Accounting Crafts. Umobong and Ironkwe (2017)

Creative accounting activities have resulted in huge investment losses by shareholders and other investors and liquidation of many organizations. These losses arose from accounting scandals in form of fraud, irregularities and material misstatements that engulfed major corporations such as Enron, Worldcom, Parmalat, Freddie Mac, American Insurance Group (AIG), Victoria (2014) and (Odoh & Udeh 2009). In Nigerian corporate environment, the presence and negative effect of creative accounting on credibility of financial reporting and corporate survival has been experienced. For example, report of creative accounting scandal in African Petroleum PLC revealed that financial statements of the company did not fairly present the company's financial position (Oyejide & Soyibo, 2001). Similarly in November 2006, an accounting scandal in Cadbury Nigeria Plc also raised more questions than answer about creative accounting (Itsueli, 2006). Also, creative accounting practice has been increasing in recent years in the Nigerian banking industry to attract unsuspecting investors, or obtain undeserved accounting-based rewards by presenting an exaggerated misleading or deceptive state of bank financial affairs (Sanusi & Izedonmi 2013). The issue that led to the collapse of diamond bank in 2017/2018 is not far-fetched.

The incessant corporate failures led to the adoption of Sarbanes – Oxley Act (2002) by USA in July, 2002. The Act applied to all public companies whose stocks are traded in USA and was designed to avoid serious accounting problems in the future. Therefore, good accounting standards that can limit the opportunistic discretion may result in accounting earnings that are more reflective of a company's underlying economic end and of higher quality are required (Jeanjean & Stolowy, 2008).

1.2 Statement of the Problem.

Normally in organizations, financial transactions are handled and prepared by trusted servants of the organization. The organization's accountants in collaboration with internal auditors are expected to prepare and present financial reports that show the true financial state of the organization concerned. The external auditor examines the financial records of the organization and makes an opinion as to whether the financial reports, in his opinion, are true reflection of the condition of the organization.

The above seems not always the case as financial statement may have been tailored towards the need of the management who might want to showcase a robust performance and very healthy organization. To that, the employees (accountants) are directed to prepare financial report to portray the organization positively. The unique nature of banking businesses which are anchored on goodwill and trust usually put such pressure on management who may erroneously believe that such creative accounting reports would attract more customers to the bank.

The practice seems not to have always paid off as could be seen from the following reported cases of organizational failure traceable to among other factors creative accounting issues, as in some cases, dividends have been paid out of capital as a result of the deceit associated with such reports. For instance, Enron an American energy giant that came into existence in July 1985 through the merger of Houston Natural gas and Inter North diversified from an energy producer to an energy trader in metal, coal, pulp and paper and other derivatives got into creative accounting practice, which in 2001, led to its colossal collapse. Many other cases abound such as the cases of Ferranti International Signal and its subsidiary, the World Com Incorporated and collapse of many banks in Nigeria of which the most recent is the collapse of diamond bank PLC and its acquisition by Access Bank PLC.

The persistence of the menace makes the need for current study worthwhile. However, we acknowledge that many studies have been carried out on creative accounting such as Sene and Inanga (2004), Domash (2002), Amat, Blake and Dowds (1999) Naser (1993), Schiff (1993), and Alam (1988) Ibanichuka and Ihendinihu (2012), Effiok and Eton (2012) Ahmed(2017) Sanusi and Izedonmi(2013), Gosh (2010), and Fizza and Qaisar, (2015) which focused mainly on the impact of creative accounting on investors' decisions in the stock market. In any case, little or no attention has been given on contribution of creative accounting on the corporate performance of the firm as it concerns the financial and non-financial performance indicators. The study therefore, wants to analyze the contribution of creative accounting practices on performance of Nigerian banks.

1.3 Objectives of the Study.

The broad objective of the study is to examine the contribution of creative accounting to the performance of banking industries in Nigeria while the specific objectives are to:

1. Ascertain the contribution of creative accounting on non-financial performance of banks in Nigeria.
2. Establish the contribution of creative accounting on financial performance of banks in Nigeria.
3. To evaluate the correlation between creative accounting contribution on non-financial and financial performance of banks in Nigeria

1.4. Research Question.

The following questions were posed to assist in the study.

1. What is the contribution of creative accounting on the financial and non-financial performance of banks in Nigeria?
2. To what extent does contribution of creative accounting differ on the financial and non-financial performance of banks in Nigeria?
3. To what extent does creative accounting contribution in non-financial performance correlate with that of financial performance in banks in Nigeria?

1.5 Hypotheses of the Study

The following null hypotheses were stated for empirical testing.

1. Creative accounting has no significant contribution on non-financial performance of banks in Nigeria.
2. Creative accounting does not have significant contribution on financial performance of banks in Nigeria.
3. There is no significant correlation in the contribution of Creative accounting on the non-financial and financial performance of banks in Nigeria.

2 REVIEWS OF PREVIOUS WORKS

This would be approached thus: conceptual review, empirical review and theoretical review

2.1 Conceptual Review

The concepts of creative accounting and firm performance shall be examined in this section

2.1.1 Creative Accounting.

Okoye (2008) stated that Creative accounting are euphemisms for accounting practices that tend to circumvent, albeit, cleverly or manipulate the rules of standard accounting practices or the spirit of those value. They are characterized by dubious complication and use of 'novel' ways of presenting income, assets or liabilities. It is deliberate dampening or fluctuations about some level of earnings considered to be normal for the firm

Shah (1996) and Jones (1991) defined creative accounting as communication techniques having in view the amelioration of the information provided to the investors. Thus, the economic entity is presenting to the investors or to the prospective investors not only financial statements that have passed through the filter of some techniques capable of generating a more favourable image on the market but also the illusion of some more attractive results. A firm can intentionally alter reported financial result, i.e. statement of profit or loss and other comprehensive income, statement of cash flows, or reported financial position, in some desired amount and/or direction.

Merchant and Rockness (1994) defines creative accounting as any action from management which can distort profits and which is not a consequence of the economic reality, it actually represents the privilege of the financial engineering. Thus, creative accounting is intentional distortion of financial report by presenting impressive financial health using options/choices in accounting. In most cases, some basic accounting principles are violated like the consistency principle.

On the effect of creative accounting on financial reporting quality, Healey and Wahlen, (1999), and Schipper (1989) notes that it undermines financial reporting quality when managers purposely intervene in financial reporting process and in structuring transactions to alter financial reports to either mislead some stakeholders about the underlying performance of the company or to influence contractual outcomes that depend on reported accounting numbers in a bid to obtain private gain. Creative accounting therefore negatively impacts on the quality of earnings, i.e., the greater the extent of creative accounting practices, the lower the earnings quality and vice versa. If earnings were managed opportunistically, the reported earnings number and the overall financial reports would be of a lower quality. Furthermore, Ali, Malik and Ortodoxia (2011) opine that creative accounting is witnessed when managers exercise their discretion over accounting numbers, with or without restrictions to achieve either firm value maximizing or opportunistic.

Griffiths (1986) in Nweze (2015. P.91) states that

> every company in the country is fiddling its profits. Every set of published accounts is issued based on books which have been gently cooked or completely roasted. The figures which are fed twice a year to the investing public have all been changed in order to protect the guilty. It is the biggest con trick since the Trojan horse….. in fact the deception is all in perfectly good taste. It is totally legitimate. It is creative accounting.

A firm can intentionally alter reported financial results, i.e., income statement and statement of cash flows, or reported financial position, i.e., the balance sheet, in some desired amount and/or some desired direction. Creative accounting is primarily accomplished through accounting transactions that are designed to achieve desired earnings level.

2.1.2. Financial Performance.

Performance generally is the ability of a company to post a distinguished out comes or result at the end of an accounting year (Ukko, Tenhunen, & Rantanen 2007), the financial performance indicator is a veritable tool used to measure the growth of firms. It is a set of quantifiable and measurable indicators that firms use to gauge its performance over time. Financial performance indicators are used to determine a company's progress in achieving its strategic and operational goals, and also to compare company's finances and general performance against other businesses within its industry. Ebrahim, Abdullah and Faudziah (2014) affirms that most widely used financial performance indicators include gross profit margin, Return on capital employed, return on assets, Net profit margin and earnings per share.

2.1.3. Non-Financial Performance.

This is another important indicator used to measure or assess the growth of firms. Such non-financial performance indicators are company reputation, labour turnover, competitiveness, and market share and customer retention. It generally include measures that relate to customer relationships, employees, operations, quality, cycle-time, and the organization's supply chain.

Wikipedia (2000) states that Non-financial measures offer four clear advantages over measurement systems based on financial data. First of these is a closer link to long-term organizational strategies. Financial evaluation systems generally focus on annual or short-term performance against accounting yardsticks. They do not deal with progress relative to customer requirements or competitors, or other non-financial objectives that may be important in achieving profitability, competitive strength and longer-term strategic goals. For example, new product development or expanding organizational capabilities may be important strategic goals, but may hinder short-term accounting performance. By supplementing accounting measures with non-financial data about strategic performance and implementation of strategic plans; companies can communicate objectives and provide incentives for managers to address long-term strategy.

Second, critics of traditional measures argue that drivers of success in many industries are "intangible assets" such as intellectual capital and customer loyalty, rather than the "hard assets" allowed on to balance sheets. Although it is difficult to quantify intangible assets in financial terms, non-financial data can provide indirect, quantitative indicators of a firm's intangible assets. By excluding these intangible assets, financially oriented measurement can encourage managers to make poor, even harmful, decisions.

Third, non-financial measures can be better indicators of future financial performance. Even when the ultimate goal is maximizing financial performance, current financial measures may not capture long-term benefits from decisions made now. Consider, for example, investments in research and development or customer satisfaction programs. Investments in customer satisfaction can improve subsequent economic performance by increasing revenues and loyalty of existing customers, attracting new customers and reducing transaction costs. Non-financial data can provide the missing link between these beneficial activities and financial results by providing forward-looking information on accounting or stock performance. For example, interim research results or customer indices may offer an indication of future cash flows that would not be captured otherwise.

Finally, the choice of measures should be based on providing information about managerial actions and the level of "noise" in the measures. Noise refers to changes in the performance measure that are beyond the control of the manager or organization, ranging from changes in the economy to luck (good or bad). Managers must be aware of how much success is due to their actions or they will not have the signals they need to maximize their effect on performance. Because many non-financial measures are less susceptible to external noise than accounting measures, their use may improve managers' performance by providing more precise evaluation of their actions. This also lowers the risk imposed on managers when determining pay.(Wikipedia 2000)

Although non-financial measures are increasingly important in decision-making and performance evaluation, companies should not simply copy measures used by others. The choice of measures must be linked to factors such as corporate strategy, value drivers, organizational objectives and the competitive environment. In addition, companies should remember that performance measurement choice is a dynamic process – measures may be appropriate today, but the system needs to be continually reassessed as strategies and competitive environments evolve.

2.2 Empirical Review

Beatty, Chamberlin and Magilolo (1995) in a study managing financial efforts of commercial bank: the influence of regulatory capital and earnings applied descriptive analysis and discover compelling evidence of income smoothing through accruals in banks and insurers.

In a similar study, Odoh and Udeh (2009), in another study, challenges of creative accounting in Nigeria adopted descriptive analysis. In the study, they noted that issues of finance are all involving and too complex to have only one set of watertight rules governing it. As a result, accounting standards provided alternative methods of treating some items. The study therefore concluded that this alternative method has given some corporate organizations the leeway to indulge on creative accounting in order to achieve predetermined result. However, Akenebor and Ibanichuka (2012), examined reasons for creative accounting practice in Nigeria banking sector. Applying descriptive analysis found that the main reason for creative accounting behavior in banks is to boost market value of shares.

Onoja and Adaaja (2015) in similar study explored the effects of creative accounting and its burden on auditors' responsibilities in Nigeria using survey research methodology. The study revealed that a wide gap exist between the public expectation and present requirements of the auditor's duties.

Furthermore, Adetoso and Ajiga (2017), in their study of creative accounting practices among listed commercial banks in Nigeria: curtailing effects of IFRS adoption, evaluated the effect of IFRS recognition, IFRS measurement, and IFRS disclosure requirements on creative accounting practices. The study utilized survey research design and found that compliance with IFRS recognition, measurement and disclosure requirements each has significant effect curtailing creative accounting practices among Nigeria listed commercial banks.

2.3 Theoretical Review.

Various theoretical framework such as agency theory, stakeholders theory, debt covenant theory and host of others but this study is anchored on shareholder theory.

Shareholder theory was propounded by Milton Freidman in the 20th century. Milton Freidman's belief in the free-market system with no government intervention helped to shape his shareholder theory. He wrote in New York Times in 1970 that there is one and only one social responsibility of business; to use its resources in activities designed to increase its profits, so long as it is within the rules of the game. In his book, "Capitalism and Freedom," shareholders theory was portrayed as a company that has no real social responsibility to the public, since its only concern is to increase profits for the shareholders.

A critical study of his assertion, indicate that whatever a business does that increases return on investment, as far as it is legal, is worthwhile. This is a direct confirmation of the pressure faced by the management that led to creative accounting. Management focus therefore is to increase the reported profit within the legal frame work not withstanding that it may be ethically wrong and in most cases deceptive. The latter effects were not put into consideration hence the sudden collapse of most firms involved.

3.0. Methodology.

The study adopted survey research design. Judgmental random sampling technique was employed to select four banks out of 21 deposit money banks in Nigeria. The banks involved were two new generation and two old generation banks comprising: Zenith Bank PLC, Access

Journal of Accounting Information and Innovation
Vol.6, No.8, August-2020;
ISSN (4243 – 406X);
p –ISSN 3467 – 7038
Impact factor: 5.83

Bank PLC, First Bank PLC and United bank for Africa (UBA) in Enugu, Enugu state. These banks were selected because Zenith bank PLC and Access Bank PLC are the leading new generation banks in Nigeria while First Bank PLC and UBA PLC are the leading old generation banks in Nigeria,

Primary data were collected from 60 respondents that were chosen through stratified random sampling technique. The sample size of 60 was made up of 30 qualified accountants and 20 internal auditors and 10 management staff from the four banks. Their selection was informed by the fact that they are in position to know the contribution of creative accounting practices on performance of banks in Nigeria.

Descriptive statistics were used to analyze hypotheses one and two in which responses to the questionnaire in 5 points Likert Scale were clustered into two groups (see Appendix 1). Group A was responses to questionnaire items pertaining to non-financial performance indices while Group B are those questionnaire items with respect to financial performance indices. The decision was that any weighted mean score from 3 and above was to be accepted as positive while weighted mean score below 3 was taken as negative response.

To test hypothesis three, which sought to ascertain the correlation in the contribution of creative accounting on financial and non-financial performance, the study used correlation technique in its analysis. Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) was used in the application of the analytical tools chosen.

4.0. Test of Hypotheses.

Hypotheses one and two were analyzed using descriptive statistics while hypothesis three was analyzed using correlation technique.

4.1 Hypothesis one

Restatement of hypothesis: Creative accounting has no significant contribution on non-financial performance of banks in Nigeria.

Table 1: Creative accounting and non-financial performance of banks in Nigeria

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
clusterA	60	7.00	24.00	15.2667	3.71377
Valid N (listwise)	60				

From table one, the clustered descriptive analysis showed the response to the six clustered questions (Cluster A) from sixty respondents in five points Likert Scale. The result of the analysis revealed a minimum of 7 and maximum point of 24, with a mean of 15.3 and standard deviation of 3.7. Since the standard deviation is greater than 3, then it is inferred that creative accounting contributes significantly on financial performance of banks in Nigeria.

4.2 **Hypothesis two**

1. Restatement of Hypothesis two: Creative accounting does not have significant contribution on financial performance of banks in Nigeria.

Table 2: Creative accounting and financial performance of banks in Nigeria

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
clusterB	60	8.00	27.00	17.7167	5.18502
Valid N (listwise)	60				

The result of descriptive analysis of responses of 60 respondents to six clustered questions(Cluster B) as shown in table 2 explicitly showed minimum of 8 and maximum point of 27 with a mean of 17.7 and standard deviation of 5.2. As the standard deviation is greater than 3, we accept the alternative hypothesis which states that creative accounting has significant contribution on financial performance of banks in Nigeria.

4.3 Hypothesis Three

Restatement of Hypothesis: There is no significant correlation in the contribution of Creative accounting on the non-financial and financial performance of banks in Nigeria.

Table 3 Correlation of creative accounting contribution on non-financial and financial performance of banks

		clusterA	clusterB
clusterA	Pearson Correlation	1	.968(**)
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
	N	60	60
clusterB	Pearson Correlation	.968(**)	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	N	60	60

** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

The result of correlation analysis (correlation coefficient of 0.97) in table 3 showed high association between the contribution of creative accounting on financial and non-financial performance of banks in Nigeria. The correlation analysis was done using clustered responses to of Cluster A and Cluster B. Cluster A and B comprises responses to six questions relating to non-financial performance and financial performance respectively. From the result, the research therefore, accepted the alternative hypothesis which states that there is significant correlation in the contribution of Creative accounting on the non-financial and financial performance of banks in Nigeria.

4.4 Discussion of Findings

Discussions of findings were done in line the objectives of the study.

Objectives one and two were to ascertain the contribution of creative accounting on non-financial and financial performance of banks in Nigeria. The results of the analyses showed that creative accounting contributes significantly to non-financial and financial performance of banks in Nigeria. These are in line with the apriori expectation as it is expected that indulgence in creative accounting practices would lead to distorted information, as such, decisions base on that would be misleading. This is true in that the true picture of the state of affairs of the organization is not x-rayed. These points to the fact that some of the poor non-financial and financial performances of some the organizations were due to decisions based on creative accounting information. The above findings are agreement with the findings of Beatty, Chamberlin and Magilolo (1995) who discover compelling evidence of income smoothing through accruals in banks and insurers and but are at variance with the findings of Odoh and Udeh (2009) who found Involvement of organizations in creative accounting practices may not be unconnected with pressure to meet targets and expectations of stake holders and impress the banking public thus boasting public confidence on the bank concerned. However, disastrous consequences arising from decisions based on the above activities outweigh the benefits inherent from such actions. This has resulted in bankruptcy/liquidation of many firms some of which have been mentioned in the study.

The third objective was to evaluate the correlation between creative accounting contribution on non-financial and financial performance of banks in Nigeria. The result of the correlation analysis indicated high correlation between contribution of creative accounting practices on financial and non financial performance of banks in Nigeria as the result showed a correlation coefficient of 0.97. This is in agreement with apriori expectation as both performance indices sum up to give overall performance of organizations and organizations base most of their decisions on information from financial reports. This thus is a confirmation that creative accounting contributed immensely to collapse of some major firms in the word, banks inclusive. It also affirms that creative accounting cannot be practices cannot be separated from bad corporate governance.

5.0 Conclusion

From the findings, the research concludes that creative accounting negatively affects banks in Nigeria as decisions made based on the information so provided were misleading and deceptive hence the reports of corporate collapse as a result of such actions. Also, financial and non-financial performances are intricately related hence the high correlation (0.968) coefficient obtained in the study.

5.1 Recommendations

The study therefore recommends as follows:

a. Management of banks should ensure that financial information are devoid of creative accounting thereby improving the quality of decisions based on that thus improving non-financial performance.

b. Accountants in the employ of organizations with intent to indulge in creative accounting practice should resist and/or persuade the management by explaining in details the implications of engaging in the act as it is unethical and give misleading financial performance indication.

c. Professional bodies should at regular intervals organize workshops emphasizing dangers of unethical practices including creative accounting not only to the whole organization but also to the accounting profession. This because creative accounting practices distorts accounting information which invariably affects other non-financial performance because of intricate relationship between corporate governance and financial performance.

5.2 Contribution to Knowledge

The study contributed significantly to knowledge in that it is to the best of the researcher's knowledge the first to examine the contribution of creative accounting practices on financial and non-financial performance of banks in Nigeria which went further and explored the correlation between the two variables to ascertain how significant it was.

References

Adetoso, J. & Ajiga O. (2017). Creative accounting practices among listed commercial banks. Curtailing effects of IFRS adoption. *Journal Resources Development and Management 3(8) 54-63.*

Ahmed (2017). The impact of creative account techniques on the reliability of financial reporting with particular reference to Saudi auditors and academics. *International Journal of Economics and Financial Issues* 7(2), 283-291.

Akenbor, C. & Ibanichuka, E.(2012). Creative accounting practices in Nigerian Banks. *An International Multidisciplinary Journal, Ethiopia*, 6(3), 23-34.

Alam, A.K.M. (1988). Creative accounting - is it leading us towards a stock market crash? The Cost and Management, *The Institute of Cost and Management Accountants of Bangladesh*, Dhaka, 16, (5) (September-October): 5-7

Ali A., Malik P. & Ortodoxia S. (2011). Creative accounting and business performance: evidence from Pakistan. *International Journal of Business Performance Management*, 12(3), 15-22.

Amat, O; Blake, J. & Dowds, J. (1999). The ethics of creative accounting. Economics working paper, *Journal of Economic Literature classification.* M41

Amao, O., & Amaeshi, K. (2008). Galvanising shareholder activism: A prerequisite for effective corporate governance and accountability in Nigeria. *Journal of Business Ethics, 82*(1), 119-130.

Beatty, A. Chamberlin, S. & Magilolo, J. (1995). Managing financial reports of commercial banks: The influence of taxes, regulatory capital and earnings. *Journal of Accounting Research, 33(2), 31-61.*

Domash, H. (2002). How to detect creative accounting: Detecting accounting Shenanigans,

http:/www.winninginvesting.com

Ebrahim, Abdullah & Faudziah (2014). The measurement of firm's performance dimensions. *Asian Journal of Finance and Accounting.*6 (1), 52-63.

Effiok, O. & Eton, E.O (2012). Creative accounting and managerial decision on selected financial institutions in Nigeria. *International Journal of Business Research and Management.* 3(1), 15-27.

Eze. A.(2016), Effect of creative accounting in firm performance. *Journal of multi-*

disciplinary studies. 1(2). 32-37.

Fizza, T. & Qaisar, A.M. (2015). Creative accounting and financial reporting: Model

development and empirical testing. *International Journal of Economics and Financial Issues*, 5(2), 544-551.

Ghosh,S. (2010). Creative Accounting: A fraudulent practice leading to corporate

collapse, *Research and Practice in Social Sciences*, 6(1), 1-15.

Griffiths, I. (1986). Creative Accounting, how to make profits and what you want them to be. https://www.amazone.com.ISBN: 09477752811

Healey, P. & Wahlen, J. (1998). A review of the creative accounting literature and its implications for standard setting. *Accounting Horizons.* 13(4), 365-383.

Ibanichuka, L. & Ihendinihu, J.U. (2012). Creative accounting and implication for dividend payout of companies in financial sub-sector of Nigeria economy. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(15), 132-134.

Itsueli, U. (2006). Published statement: Cadbury Nigeria PLC update on investigation into

financial Position. *The Guardian*, December 12.

Jeanjean, T. & Stolowy, H. (2008). Do accounting standards matter? An explanatory analysis of earnings management before and after IFRS adoption. *Journal of accounting and public policy*, 27(1), 480-494.

Jones, J. (1991). Earnings management during import relief investigations. *Journal of Accounting Research*, 29, 193-228.

Naser, K. (1993), Creative Financial Accounting: Its Nature and Use. Hemel Hempstead: Prentice Hall.

Nweze (2015). *Inaugural lecture of Enugu State University of Science and Technology*. June 11th, 2015.

Odoh C. & Udeh S. (2009). Challenges of creative accounting in Nigeria. *Journal of Accounting.* 1(1), 141-150.

Okoye, E I. & Alao, B.B (2008). The ethics of creative accounting in financial reporting: The challenges of Regulatory agencies in Nigeria.

Olatunde, J.O. & Olayinka, M.U (2014). Creative accounting and financial scandals in Nigeria: structures and actors analysis. *International Journal of Economics and Accounting*,5 (3), 15-23.

Onoja, E. & Adaaja, O.E. (2015). The effects of creative accounting and its burden on auditors' possibilities in Nigeria. *Journal of good governance and sustainable development in Africa*, 24, 96-108.

Sanusi & Izedonmi (2014). Nigerian commercial banks and creative accounting practices. *Journal of Mathematical Finance*, 4, 75-83

Schiff, D. (1993). The dangers of creative accounting, worth (March): 92-94. Reprinted in Aileen Ormiston (ed.) (1998), *Accounting 98/99* (Guilford, Connecticut, USA: Dushkin/McGraw-Hill): 94-96.

Schipper, K., Vincent, L. (2004), Earnings management. *Accounting Horizon*, 17, 97-110.

Sen, D. K. & Inanga, E. L. (2005). Creative accounting in Bangladesh and global perspectives, partners, conference programme book. *Maastricht School of Management*. The Netherlands (July, 6-8), 78-87.

Shah, A. (1998), Balance, accountability and responsiveness. The World Bank operations evaluation department country and regional evaluation division.

Ukko, J. Tenhunen, J. & Rantanen, H.(2007), Performance measurement impacts on management and leadership: Perspectives of management and employees. *International Journal of Production Economics*. 110(1/2), 39-51.

Umobong, A. & Ironkwe, U. (2017). Creative accounting practices and financial performance of firms. *International Journal of Innovative Finance and Economic Research*. 5(1), 1-10.

Victoria, F. (2014), An empirical study on the impact of creative accounting policies on the performance of listed Romanian companies. *Valahian Journal of Economic Studies*, 5(4), 41-48.

Wikepedia(2000)file:///C:/Users/HP/Desktop/Nonfinancial%20Performance%20Measures_%

20What%20Works%20and%20What%20Doesn't%20-20Knowledge@Wharton.html

APPENDIX 1
QUESTIONNAIRE

SECTION A:
Position/Rank: ____
Highest educational Qualification: ______________________________
Years of experience: _____________________________________
Gender: ____
SECTIONB:
NON FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE

S/N	Questions	SA	A	D	SD	UND
1	Creative accounting increases market share of the banks involved					
2	Creative accounting facilitates productivity improvement in banks.					
3	Creative accounting improves quality control in banks					
4	It enhances to employee development and safety					
5	Creative accounting provides fertile ground for research and development in banks in Nigeria					
6	Creative accounting helps in reducing labour turn over in banks in Nigeria					
	FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE					
1	Creative accounting enhances Dividend payment by banks in Nigeria					
2	Creative accounting improve Return on Equity in banks					
3	Creative accounting helps in improving the liquidity of banks in Nigeria.					
4	It improves Debt Capitalization Ratio in Nigerian Banks					
5	Creative accounting increases Debt Equity Ratio					
6	It improves Leverage Ratios of Nigerian banks					